



**PAVEE POINT**  
TRAVELLER AND ROMA CENTRE

## **RACIAL DISCRIMINATION AGAINST IRISH TRAVELLERS & ROMA**

### **Alternative Report**

#### **A Response to Ireland's Combined Fifth to Ninth Periodic Reports to the UN Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination**

**November 2019**



**Published by:**

Pavee Point Traveller & Roma Centre  
46 Charles Street Great, Dublin 1, Ireland

[www.paveepoint.ie](http://www.paveepoint.ie)

Tel: + 353 1 878 0255

[patrick.reilly@pavee.ie](mailto:patrick.reilly@pavee.ie), [laura.pohjolainen@pavee.ie](mailto:laura.pohjolainen@pavee.ie)

## LIST OF CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY &amp; KEY RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>SECTION 1. MEASURES TO ELIMINATE DISCRIMINATION AGAINST TRAVELLERS &amp; ROMA- ART.2</b> ....	<b>4</b>
1.1 POLICY MEASURES TO PROTECT THE RIGHTS OF TRAVELLERS & ROMA.....	4
1.1.1 Disaggregated Data to Inform Policy, Budgets & Programming (para. 34, 36, 53, 119-122) .....	4
1.1.2 National Action Plan against Racism (para. 25-26) .....	4
1.1.3 National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy (NTRIS) 2017-2021 (para. 33-36) & National Strategy for Women and Girls (NSWG) 2017-2020 (para. 158-160) .....	5
1.1.4 Participation in Mainstream Social Inclusion Plans and Programmes (para. 37-38) .....	5
1.1.5 Financial Investment towards Traveller and Roma Inclusion .....	6
1.2 LEGISLATING AGAINST ETHNIC PROFILING (para. 88-90) .....	6
<b>SECTION 2: PROHIBITION OF RACIAL INCITEMENT – ARTICLE 4</b> .....	<b>6</b>
2.1 HATE SPEECH & CRIME AGAINST TRAVELLERS & ROMA .....	6
<b>SECTION 3: EQUALITY IN THE ENJOYMENT OF RIGHTS - ARTICLE 5</b> .....	<b>7</b>
3.1 EQUAL TREATMENT IN FRONT OF ORGANS ADMINISTERING JUSTICE (para. 78-92).....	7
3.1.1 Irish Police Service (An Garda Síochána).....	7
3.1.1.1 Measures to Address Anti-Traveller & Roma Discrimination in Policing Practices .....	7
3.1.1.2 Garda Síochána (Discipline) Regulations 2007 & Garda Síochána Code of Ethics .....	7
3.1.2 Travellers Sentenced to Prison .....	8
3.2 HOUSING & ACCOMMODATION .....	8
3.2.1 Travellers - Discrimination in Accommodation and Housing (para. 39-43).....	8
3.2.2 Roma – Discrimination in Housing .....	9
3.3 ROMA CHILDREN & RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY .....	10
3.4 RIGHT TO HEALTH (para. 44-48) .....	10
3.5 RIGHT TO EMPLOYMENT (para. 54, 55) .....	11
3.6 RIGHT TO EDUCATION (para. 49-53).....	12
3.6.1 Travellers and Roma in National Education Policy Initiatives (para 34, 35, 50 & 51).....	12
3.6.2 Mainstreaming Approach to Traveller and Roma Education (para. 52) .....	12
3.7 POLITICAL RIGHTS .....	13
<b>SECTION 4: REMEDIES FOR RACIAL DISCRIMINATION – ARTICLE 6</b> .....	<b>13</b>
4.1 ACCESS TO COMPLAINT MECHANISMS .....	13
4.2 RIGHT OF ACCESS TO PUBLIC SPACES .....	14
<b>SECTION 5: EFFORTS TO COMBAT RACIAL PREJUDICE – ARTICLE 7</b> .....	<b>14</b>
5.1 Promoting Traveller and Roma Cultures.....	14
5.2 Traveller and Roma Cultures in Schools .....	15
5.3 Awareness Raising with Law Enforcement Officials .....	15
5.4 Recruitment of Travellers and Roma within Public Services .....	15
<b>Appendix 1. Examples of Ethnic Profiling of Travellers and Roma by the Police</b> .....	<b>17</b>
<b>Appendix 2: Examples of Hate Speech and Crime against Travellers and Roma</b> .....	<b>17</b>

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY & KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

In light of persistent racism and discrimination experienced by Irish Travellers and Roma in Ireland we respectfully ask the CERD Committee to make the following recommendations to the State in these **priority areas specific to the situation of Travellers and Roma:**

❖ **To significantly and immediately step up implementation of the National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy (NTRIS) through adequately resourced actions by all Government Departments involved, including but not only by the Department of Justice and Equality, with the actions taken in full consultation with Traveller and Roma organisations:**

- Strengthen the existing implementation and monitoring plan for the NTRIS by adopting clear targets, indicators, outcomes, timeframes and budget lines

❖ **Ensure direct targeting of Travellers and Roma in all other existing state strategies<sup>1</sup> relevant to the social, economic and cultural inclusion of Travellers and Roma and:**

- Strengthen the existing implementation and monitoring plans for the strategies by adopting clear targets, indicators, outcomes, timeframes and budget lines for the strategies
- Ensure that the strategies are implemented in a coordinated and consistent way with one another and in line with Public Sector Equality and Human Rights Duty under Section 42 of the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission Act 2014 <sup>1</sup>

❖ **To address the issues of State agencies not fully spending available budgets allocated towards Traveller inclusion:**

- Establish a mechanism in partnership with Traveller and Roma civil society organisations to ensure actions and allocated budgets across all Traveller and Roma policy areas are fully implemented and spent

❖ **To address accommodation crisis within the Traveller community:**

- Ensure full implementation of recommendations by an Independent Expert Group on Traveller accommodation, including overhauling legislation and policies which impact on accommodation provision for Travellers

❖ **The State has not committed to addressing the housing situation of Roma in its policies or programming:**

- Address the housing crisis among Roma by introducing clear actions and associated implementation plan and resources in the current National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy

❖ **Despite many Roma children having been resident in the State for several years, many are unable to access Child Benefit payments:**

- To ensure Roma children have access to basic income, make Child Benefit payment a truly universal payment that is not contingent on the fulfilment of the Habitual Residence Condition

❖ **To address discrimination and disadvantage faced by Travellers and Roma in employment and education:**

- Develop **a)** a Traveller and Roma Education Strategy and **b)** Traveller and Roma Training, Employment and Enterprise Strategy with robust implementation and monitoring plans

---

<sup>1</sup> The National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017-2021, National Strategy for Women and Girls 2017-2020, National Strategy on Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based Violence 2016-2021, Sustainable, Inclusive and Empowered Communities: A Five Year Strategy to Support the Community and Voluntary Sector in Ireland, the upcoming National Action Plan on Social Inclusion, and the new Traveller Health Action Plan that is currently being developed.

We also ask the Committee to make the following recommendations to the State in these **overarching** areas:

- ❖ **Collect, analyse and disseminate disaggregated data by ethnicity and gender across relevant administrative systems in line with human rights standards, and use this data to monitor anti-Traveller and Roma discrimination and equality proof State policies, budgets and programming**
- ❖ **Develop a new national action plan against racism that is inclusive of Irish Travellers and Roma, and include Travellers and Roma in the functions and scope of a proposed new anti-racism committee**
- ❖ **Develop and enact:**
  - **Hate speech and hate crime legislation that include Travellers and Roma in their protections**
  - **Legislation to prohibit ethnic profiling by the police and other law enforcement agencies**
- ❖ **Acknowledge and address throughout all actions for Traveller and Roma inclusion and all responses to the Concluding Observations by the CERD Committee the particular intersectional and gendered racism and discrimination experienced by Traveller and Roma women and girls**

We make further recommendations in other key areas as referred to in the main body of the report and respectfully ask for the Committee to call upon the State to take coordinated action in all these areas to ensure the rights of Travellers and Roma are promoted, protected and realised. In doing so, we urge the Irish State to meet its commitments in relation to achieving Sustainable Development Goals and Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action.

## INTRODUCTION

### Reporting Organisation

Pavee Point is a national NGO committed to the realisation of human rights for Irish Travellers and Roma in Ireland. As minority ethnic groups, Travellers and Roma are among the most marginalised and excluded individuals and groups in Ireland due to racism and discrimination based on ethnicity, gender and other factors.

### Structure of the Report

Our Alternative Report provides a response to Ireland’s consolidated Combined Fifth to Ninth Periodic Reports to the CERD Committee.<sup>2</sup> It is informed by issues identified by Travellers and Roma through consultations and key pieces of research.<sup>3</sup> The report is structured in accordance with articles of the ICERD and references are made to paragraphs of the State report, particularly when alternative information is provided to specific points made in the State report.

### General Overview since the Committee’s Previous Examination of the State Party (2011-2019)

Pavee Point has welcomed the historic and symbolic recognition of Irish Travellers as an ethnic group in 2017, as well as the inclusion of Travellers and Roma in some key policy measures. However, a number of human rights bodies have raised significant concerns in relation to persistent and deteriorating situation of Travellers and Roma. This is particularly as a result of the impact of austerity measures undertaken during 2008-2013, which continues to be seen today. At the eve of Brexit, there is a significant concern that Travellers, Roma and other groups in most need of social inclusion measures will yet again bear the brunt of any potential negative impact Brexit may have on the Irish economy.

Travellers and Roma continue to experience significant racism and discrimination by public and private actors with little State action to address racism. Implementation and monitoring of legislation, policies and strategies related to Traveller and Roma inclusion is slow, with inadequate funding put in place. In areas where funding has been allocated to Traveller inclusion (e.g. accommodation), there remains significant underspending of the budgets with no mechanisms in place to encourage public authorities to spend them.

Traveller and Roma inclusion has also become primarily driven by the Department of Justice and Equality, undermining the ‘whole of government approach’ to Traveller and Roma inclusion that the State has committed to adopting. For instance, in the area of Traveller health policy no new consultative structures have been established by the Department of Health since 2012 (see section 3.4), and in Traveller education policy no consultative mechanism has been reinstated by the Department of Education and Skills since 2015 (see section 3.6.1).

Discrimination against Travellers at a Glance	Discrimination against Roma at a Glance <sup>4</sup>
<p>Irish Travellers are an indigenous minority ethnic group in Ireland. Under international definition, Irish Travellers belong to the umbrella group of ‘Roma’. There are a little over 36,000 Travellers in Ireland, representing less than 1% of the Irish population.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Travellers are 10 times more likely than White Irish to experience discrimination in seeking work<sup>5</sup></li><li>• Travellers are over 22 times more likely than White Irish to report discrimination in shops, pubs and restaurants<sup>6</sup></li><li>• 40% of Travellers experience discrimination in accessing health services<sup>7</sup></li></ul>	<p>An estimated 5,000 Roma live in Ireland, many of whom are second and third generation Roma. The implementation of EU Directive 2004/38 and state policy (Habitual Residence Condition) leaves many Roma outside the social protection system and, thus, vulnerable to poverty and social exclusion.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• 78.9% of Roma feel discriminated in getting a job</li><li>• 93.3% feel discriminated in getting accommodation</li><li>• 84.4% feel discriminated in getting social welfare</li><li>• 81.1% feel discriminated in a public setting</li></ul>

## SECTION 1. MEASURES TO ELIMINATE DISCRIMINATION AGAINST TRAVELLERS & ROMA- ARTICLE 2

### 1.1 POLICY MEASURES TO PROTECT THE RIGHTS OF TRAVELLERS & ROMA

#### 1.1.1 Disaggregated Data to Inform Policy, Budgets & Programming (para. 34, 36, 53, 119-122)

Concerns at the lack of disaggregated data by ethnicity and gender have been raised by numerous international human rights monitoring bodies.<sup>8</sup> While positive developments have taken place with the collection of ethnic data by some state agencies (Central Statistics Office, Pobal, National Drug Treatment Recording System),<sup>9</sup> with others there is either significant resistance to collect such data or concerns over collecting the data in line with human rights standards.<sup>10</sup>

The national police service (An Garda Síochána) and the Courts Service report that there is ‘no legal basis for ethnic data to be collected’ (para. 121).<sup>11</sup> This is despite legislation on public sector duty, which mandates all public bodies to take proactive steps to assess equality and eliminate discrimination.<sup>12</sup> The data analysis exercise to track outcomes for Traveller and Roma children through primary education reported by the State (para. 53) has not been made publicly available and there are concerns with collecting this data in line with human rights standards.<sup>13</sup>

Because the Irish police service doesn’t disaggregate data by ethnicity, the Central Statistics Office doesn’t produce crime statistics by ethnicity (para. 119-122). The police may record crimes motivated by bias or discrimination in the PULSE (police data system), including crimes motivated by anti-Traveller and anti-Roma bias. However, there is an underreporting of racist crime by Travellers and Roma,<sup>14</sup> and the quality of data recorded by the police is contested by the Central Statistics Office.<sup>15</sup>

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) **Collect, analyse and disseminate disaggregated data by ethnicity and gender across relevant administrative systems in line with human rights standards, and use this data to monitor anti-Traveller and Roma discrimination and equality proof State policies, budgets and programming**

#### 1.1.2 National Action Plan against Racism (para. 25-26)

Despite recommendations by international human rights monitoring bodies, the National Action Plan against Racism (2005-2008) was never renewed.<sup>16</sup> In 2019, ECRI urged the State to develop a new strategy against racism with a strong focus on Travellers and Roma.<sup>17</sup>

Since the abolition of the National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism in 2008 (para.26), responsibility for anti-racism initiatives was transferred to the functions of the Office for the Promotion of Migrant Integration (OPMI.) The OPMI closed in 2019 as part of restructuring of the Department of Justice and Equality.

In the context of the State’s Migrant Integration Strategy (MIS), it was announced that a new anti-racism committee would be established in 2019 to make recommendations on strengthening the State’s approach to combating racism.<sup>18</sup> However, Irish Travellers - an indigenous minority ethnic group- are not included in the scope of the MIS.<sup>19</sup> This suggests that Travellers may be excluded from the work of the proposed anti-racism committee.<sup>20</sup>

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) **Develop a new national action plan against racism that is inclusive of Travellers and Roma**
- b) **Ensure the inclusion of Travellers and Roma in the functions and scope of the proposed new anti-racism committee, and ensure the inclusion of Traveller and Roma representative organisations in its membership**

### **1.1.3 National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy (NTRIS) 2017-2021 (para. 33-36) & National Strategy for Women and Girls (NSWG) 2017-2020 (para. 158-160)**

As the main targeted measure for the social inclusion of Travellers and Roma, the State reports 'good progress' with the implementation of Ireland's current NTRIS (para 36).<sup>21</sup> While it is starting to develop some new welcome approaches, little additional budgetary resources have been put towards implementing the Strategy and progress has been slow. The Strategy Committee monitoring the implementation of the NTRIS only meets three times per year, and the Strategy could be strengthened with the addition of clearer targets, indicators, outcomes, timeframes and associated budget lines against which progress could be measured.

For the first time, the NSWG 2017-2020 contains actions related to Traveller and Roma women. However, the actions rely solely on the implementation of gendered actions in the NTRIS. With NTRIS having no clear implementation plan, the actions related to Traveller and Roma women in the NSWG have not been progressed. In 2019, the Advisory Committee on the FCNM urged the State to implement the NTRIS and NSWG in a coordinated and consistent way.<sup>22</sup> A number of other international human rights bodies have called on the State to adopt a clear implementation plan and budget lines for the NTRIS.<sup>23</sup> Further measures are also needed to ensure direct targeting of Travellers and Roma in all other existing strategies relevant to the social, economic and cultural inclusion of Travellers and Roma.

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

##### **In relation to the NTRIS:**

- a) To significantly and immediately step up implementation of the NTRIS through adequately resourced actions by all Government Departments involved, including but not only by the Department of Justice and Equality, with the actions taken in full consultation with Traveller and Roma organisations**
- b) Strengthen the existing implementation and monitoring of the NTRIS by adopting clear targets, indicators, outcomes, timeframes and budget lines for the Strategy**

##### **In relation to the NSWG and other mainstream strategies:**

- a) Ensure direct targeting of Travellers and Roma in all other existing state strategies relevant to the social, economic and cultural inclusion of Travellers and Roma**
- b) Develop a robust implementation plan for actions related to Traveller and Roma women in the NSWG, and implement the gendered actions in the NTRIS and NSWG in a coordinated and consistent way with one another and in line with Public Sector Equality and Human Rights Duty under Section 42 of the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission Act 2014**

### **1.1.4 Participation in Mainstream Social Inclusion Plans and Programmes (para. 37-38)**

Roma and Travellers are under-represented in national social inclusion programmes related to employment, training, health, accommodation and education.<sup>24</sup> Less than 2% of the Social Inclusion & Community Activation Programme caseload and less than 3% of actions with local community groups in 2016 were from Traveller and Roma communities.<sup>25</sup>

It is unclear whether Travellers and Roma will be included in the new National Action Plan on Social Inclusion currently being drafted by the State. To date, there has been little, if any, consultation with groups most affected by poverty, racism and discrimination in developing this Plan.<sup>26</sup> Proportionately more resourcing is needed to empower Traveller and Roma groups to tackle the multiple levels of exclusion and discrimination experienced by their communities.

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Include Travellers and Roma in the upcoming National Action Plan on Social Inclusion, and allocate specific targets, indicators, timeframes and adequate human and financial resources to specific programming related to the social inclusion of Travellers and Roma**

### **1.1.5 Financial Investment towards Traveller and Roma Inclusion**

A number of international human rights monitoring bodies have raised concerns at the significant reductions in budget allocations towards Traveller and Roma inclusion during the 2008-2013 recession and at the significant underspend of Traveller specific budgets by state agencies.<sup>27</sup> The cuts to Traveller specific programming that took place during the recession have not been reversed, and more shockingly, underspending of budgets allocated towards Traveller inclusion remains a significant issue, particularly in Traveller accommodation (see section 3.2.1).

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Establish a mechanism in partnership with Traveller and Roma civil society organisations to ensure allocated actions and budgets across all Traveller and Roma policy areas are fully implemented and spent**

### **1.2 LEGISLATING AGAINST ETHNIC PROFILING (para. 88-90)**

There are serious concerns around ethnic profiling of Travellers and Roma by the police (an Garda Síochána), but no legislation to prohibit it (see Appendix 1 for examples). In 2019, the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) raised concerns about ethnic profiling of Roma by the police, and urged the State to clearly define and prohibit it with legislative measures.<sup>28</sup>

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Introduce legislation to prohibit ethnic profiling by the police and other law enforcement agencies**

## **SECTION 2: PROHIBITION OF RACIAL INCITEMENT – ARTICLE 4**

### **2.1 HATE SPEECH & CRIME AGAINST TRAVELLERS & ROMA**

Roma and Travellers are subjected to hate crime and speech on a daily basis by private and public actors (see Appendix 1 for examples). The Prohibition of Incitement to Hatred Act 1989 (para. 65) has long been recognised as inadequate for dealing with hate speech, including by the CERD Committee in 2011. Only a small number of convictions have been secured under the Act, and the Act fails to address online hate speech.<sup>29</sup> While the State has committed to reviewing the Act, the review is yet to be published.<sup>30</sup>

There is no legislation dealing with hate crime (para. 68-69),<sup>31</sup> and there is a lack of guidance and direction to the police and prosecutors in relation to recording and prosecuting hate crime. Without a legal obligation, it remains at the discretion of the judge to take into account all elements of the offence, including potential racist motivation. In 2019, the Advisory Committee on the FCNM and ECRI called for the enactment of new hate speech and hate crime legislation in Ireland.<sup>32</sup>

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Develop and enact effective and comprehensive hate speech and hate crime legislation that include Travellers and Roma in their protections**



## SECTION 3: EQUALITY IN THE ENJOYMENT OF RIGHTS - ARTICLE 5

### 3.1 EQUAL TREATMENT IN FRONT OF ORGANS ADMINISTERING JUSTICE (para. 78-92)

#### 3.1.1 Irish Police Service (An Garda Síochána)

##### 3.1.1.1 Measures to Address Anti-Traveller & Roma Discrimination in Policing Practices

The work of the Garda National Diversity and Integration Unit (GNDIU) and Ethnic Liaison Officers (para. 87) have been undermined by inadequate human and financial resources, and have not provided a solution to addressing policing issues with Traveller and Roma communities.<sup>33</sup> Negative stereotypes and prejudice against Travellers and Roma are often manifested in under-policing (not providing sufficient support and protection); over-policing in certain situations and crimes; or using excessive force:

- 77.5% of Roma women report being stopped by the police
- 53.9% of Roma said they felt discriminated by the police or in the courts<sup>34</sup>
- Travellers report ill-treatment by the police, including abusive, discriminatory and racist language and physical violence<sup>35</sup>

In September 2019, video footage on social media emerged where a member of the police and fire brigade services engaged in impersonating and mocking the Traveller community.<sup>36</sup> The incident exemplified the many lived experiences of racial bias and stereotypes that Travellers report to be subjected to by the police. The seriousness of the incident was acknowledged by both the Garda (police) Commissioner and the individuals involved in producing the footage. The Garda Commissioner has indicated that measures would be taken with the new Garda Diversity Strategy to address some recent issues with public, racist behaviour of some police. This is to be welcomed.

The Garda Diversity Strategy 2019-2021, National Strategy on Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based Violence 2016-2021 (NSDSGBV), and National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017-2021 (NTRIS) are all highlighted by the State as key measures aimed at addressing issues with policing with Traveller and Roma communities. However, to date the latter two Strategies have resulted in little coordinated action. In this light, Pavee Point welcomes the newly established Garda Traveller Advisory Group in October 2019 and increased communication with relevant police Bureaus. However, the Strategies - including the recently launched Garda Diversity Strategy - currently do not have clear implementation plans with associated targets, indicators or budget lines.

#### Recommendation to the Irish State:

- Address discrimination against Travellers and Roma in policing by adopting robust implementation plans with clear actions, indicators, targets, outcomes and budget lines for the Garda Diversity Strategy; National Strategy on Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based Violence; and the National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy**
- Ensure the Strategies are implemented and monitored in a coordinated and consistent way and in partnership with Traveller and Roma civil society organisations**

##### 3.1.1.2 Garda Síochána (Discipline) Regulations 2007 & Garda Síochána Code of Ethics

In 2019, the Advisory Committee on the FCNM noted with regret that according to the Garda Síochána (Discipline) Regulations 2007, discrimination does not explicitly constitute a breach of discipline.<sup>37</sup> The Committee also noted how the role of the Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission (GSOC)- an independent body with power to investigate any report of malpractice (para. 78)- has been undermined by lack of resources. 40% of investigations initiated, in particular in the framework of disciplinary procedures, are carried out by police officers not attached to the GSOC.<sup>38</sup>

The Garda Síochána Code of Ethics (para. 76) doesn't specifically require the police to act in a manner consistent with equal treatment or non-discrimination.<sup>39</sup> Where a breach of the Code may occur, there are no mandatory standards against which members of the police will be monitored or sanctioned.<sup>40</sup> In 2018, it was reported that only half of the police who had received training on the new Code of Ethics had signed a declaration form to testify they subscribe to the Code.<sup>41</sup>

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Amend the Garda Síochána (Discipline) Regulations 2007 to explicitly specify that discrimination constitutes a breach of discipline<sup>42</sup>**
- b) Take necessary steps to ensure that the Garda Síochána (police) Code of Ethics is fully implemented in policing culture, strategies, policies, processes and behaviour, including introducing sanctions and disciplinary measures when breaches of the Code take place**

### **3.1.2 Travellers Sentenced to Prison**

Although Travellers account for only 0.7% of the Irish population, they account for an estimated 10% of the entire prison population and 15% of the female prison population.<sup>43</sup> The risk for a Traveller woman being imprisoned is 18 to 22 times higher than that of the general population.<sup>44</sup> Research shows how Traveller women have been subjected to abusive, discriminatory and racist language and physical violence by the police,<sup>45</sup> and in prison can experience discrimination from other prisoners and/or prison staff.<sup>46</sup> To further add to the concern, the majority of Traveller women are sent to prison for non-violent, poverty related offences. They have a background of experiences of racial discrimination, social and educational disadvantage, homelessness, illiteracy, mental health problems, domestic violence, and/or drug and alcohol dependency.<sup>47</sup>

#### **Recommendations to the Irish State:**

- a) Identify and address the contributing factors to the overrepresentation of Travellers in prison, particularly Traveller women, as recommended by CEDAW Committee in 2017<sup>48</sup>**
- b) Introduce alternative community-based responses for Travellers and Roma who have committed non-violent poverty related offences**

## **3.2 HOUSING & ACCOMMODATION**

### **3.2.1 Travellers - Discrimination in Accommodation and Housing (para. 39-43)**

The State notes (para. 41) a reduction in the number of Traveller families living in 'unauthorised sites' and claims this "as evidence of the results of investment in Traveller accommodation" and of "high level of Traveller specific accommodation delivery". Yet, recent research commissioned by a state body shows that the number of Traveller families living on unauthorised sites increased by 20% between 2010 and 2015.<sup>49</sup>

Traveller accommodation is at a crisis point as the State has continuously failed to provide adequate levels and standard of Traveller accommodation. Serious concerns have been raised over the Housing (Traveller Accommodation) Act 1998 and the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002 (see below) by a significant number of human rights bodies.<sup>50</sup> In 2019, an independent Expert Group on Traveller Accommodation set out a clear recommendation to overhaul all relevant legislation and policies which impact on accommodation provision for Travellers,<sup>51</sup> and the Advisory Committee on the FCNM and ECRI urged the State to tackle a problem of underspending of Traveller accommodation budgets by Local Authorities.<sup>52</sup>

#### ***The Housing (Traveller Accommodation) Act 1998***

The Housing (Traveller Accommodation) Act 1998 places responsibility for the provision of Traveller accommodation on Local Authorities. The Traveller accommodation budget (para. 42), which fell from €40m in 2008 to €4m in 2013, stands at a mere €13m in 2019. Even more disturbing is that

substantial parts of the budgets have remained unspent by Local Authorities, with no incentives or sanctions in place to ensure that Local Authorities meet their legal obligations. According to the Minister for Housing, Planning and Local Government, 19 local authorities have not drawn down any of the 2019 funding towards Traveller specific accommodation, with a mere €1.84 million out of €13 million drawn down to date.

The lack of accommodation provision has pushed many Travellers into sharing accommodation/overcrowding, unauthorised sites, private rented sector and/or homelessness. The State's own figures estimate 15% of Travellers to be homeless, yet Travellers only make up 1% of the Irish population.<sup>53</sup> In 2019, the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission launched a national review into Traveller accommodation provision.<sup>54</sup>

### *Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002*

The introduction of the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002 criminalised trespass, and thus the nomadic tradition of Travellers. Many Travellers who are waiting to be accommodated by a Local Authority are left with no option but to camp on roadsides or live on unauthorised sites. In these instances, Local Authorities use the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002 to undertake forced evictions of Travellers.<sup>55</sup>

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

**a) Ensure full implementation of recommendations by the Independent Expert Group on Traveller accommodation and a number of international human rights bodies,<sup>56</sup> including overhauling legislation and policies which impact on accommodation provision for Travellers**

### **3.2.2 Roma – Discrimination in Housing**

#### **Ireland's first National Roma Needs Assessment shows that:<sup>57</sup>**

- 12.4% of Roma have no kitchen; 9.6% no cooker; 13.5% no fridge; many sometimes go without enough food, gas, water and/or electricity; 45% do not have enough beds in their accommodation
- 6.6% of Roma report to be currently homeless and 45.7% have been homeless at some stage<sup>58</sup>
- In many instances Roma families pay rent for unsafe and unhygienic warehouses with no electricity or water. Others live with rat infestations, damp, broken windows and no light to do homework

A staggering 93.3% of Roma feel discriminated against in getting accommodation, and many face severe overcrowding, poor and dangerous accommodation conditions, homelessness, and lack of access to social housing and rent supplement. The majority of Roma live in private rented accommodation with only 13% renting from a local authority. Lack of documentation is a key barrier for accessing local authority housing and rent supplement. The application of the Habitual Residence Condition (see section 3.3) and the Housing Circular 41/2012 is preventing many Roma from accessing a range of social welfare supports, including housing and homeless supports.<sup>59</sup>

There has been no coordinated State response to address the housing situation faced by Roma. The Department of Housing, Planning, Community and Local Government has stated that they bear no legal mandate or responsibility for providing for the accommodation needs of 'Roma migrants'. This fails to take into account that there are now second and third generation Roma in Ireland.

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

**a) Address the housing crisis among Roma by introducing clear actions and associated implementation plan and resources in the current National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy**

### 3.3 ROMA CHILDREN & RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY

#### %of Roma facing some or all of the issues below:<sup>60</sup>

- Children gone to school hungry (25%) or without adequate lunches (35%)
- Not always enough food (49.5%) or fuel (46.2%) and cannot keep the house warm all the time (66.3%)
- Not enough money for school books and uniforms (57.5%)

Despite Child Benefit being a ‘universal’ payment in Ireland, many Roma children are not entitled to this or any other social protection payment. 40% of Roma households with children are not successful in applying for social protection payments. It is important to note that of Roma who are not successful in their social protection applications, the average number of years they have lived in Ireland is eight years. 84.4% of Roma also feel discriminated against in getting social welfare, regardless of the success of their application.<sup>61</sup>

Lack of access to child benefit is directly linked to the implementation of right to reside, European Directive 2004/38, and Habitual Residence Condition (HRC), policy by the Department of Social Protection.<sup>62</sup> Establishing a right to reside is a prerequisite to meeting the HRC, which a person must meet in order to access welfare supports, including Child Benefit, Rent Allowance, public housing, and employment and training supports.<sup>63</sup> Roma parents face significant difficulties with proving residency in the State with lack of documentation, proof of address and language and literacy skills.<sup>64</sup> In 2017, the CEDAW Committee noted how social welfare restrictions hinder entitlement to child benefit payments for Roma women. Concerns about Roma child poverty and the discriminatory effect of the Habitual Residence Condition on Roma to access basic social welfare payments have been raised by a number of international human rights bodies, including UNCRC.<sup>65</sup>

#### Recommendation to the Irish State:

- a) **To ensure Roma children have access to basic income, make Child Benefit payment a truly universal payment that is not contingent on the fulfilment of the Habitual Residence Condition<sup>66</sup>**

### 3.4 RIGHT TO HEALTH (para. 44-48)

Travellers – Health Disadvantages <sup>67</sup>	Roma – Health Disadvantages <sup>68</sup>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 67% of health services agree that discrimination against Travellers occurs sometimes in their services</li> <li>• 134 excess Traveller deaths per year</li> <li>• Infant mortality rate is 3.6 times higher than in the general population</li> <li>• Traveller suicide rate is 6 times higher in comparison to general population and accounts for approximately 11% of all Traveller deaths</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 84% of Roma women have experienced discrimination in health services, versus 53% of Roma men</li> <li>• 51% of Roma report more than 14 days of the previous month when their mental health was not good</li> <li>• 36% of Roma women report difficulty in accessing maternity services</li> <li>• 50% of Roma report not to have access to medical cards and GP care</li> </ul>

Since the Traveller Health Strategy 2002-2005, National Intercultural Health Strategy 2007-2012,<sup>69</sup> and last National Traveller Health Advisory Committee meeting in 2012, there has been no targeted action plan or consultative structure in place to address Traveller health inequalities. The State’s approach since has focused on mainstreaming, but the naming of Travellers in mainstream health programming (including Sláintecare<sup>70</sup> and Healthy Ireland<sup>71</sup>) has not resulted in targeted or meaningful action.

The State reports the role of the Health Service Executive’s (HSE) Traveller Health Advisory Forum (THAF) and the associated regional Traveller Health Units (THUs) in monitoring progress and identifying emerging health issues for Travellers (para. 45). However, the THAF does not play a role in driving the development of Traveller health policy, and the budgets for THUs are under resourced. Within this context, Pavee Point welcomes the development of a new Traveller Health Action Plan, which is currently underway.<sup>72</sup>

**Recommendation to the Irish State:**

**With due reference to the CERD General Recommendation 32 on Special Measures:**

- a) Publish the new Traveller Health Action Plan in a timely fashion; establish a clear consultative structure to drive its implementation and monitoring; and ensure all actions in the Plan have clear targets, indicators, outcomes, timeframes and budget lines**
- b) Ensure direct targeting of Travellers and Roma in key mainstream policy initiatives related to health, including Sláintecare and Healthy Ireland**

**3.5 RIGHT TO EMPLOYMENT (para. 54, 55)**

Travellers – Employment Disadvantages	Roma – Employment Disadvantages <sup>73</sup>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 55% of Travellers have experienced discrimination at work<sup>74</sup></li> <li>• 80.2% of Travellers are unemployed<sup>75</sup></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 78.9% of Roma feel discriminated against in getting a job</li> <li>• 16.7% of Roma are employed</li> <li>• 17.6% of Roma households report begging as a source of income in order to survive</li> </ul>

Travellers and Roma experience disproportionately high rates of unemployment due to low educational attainment, discrimination, childcare and family commitments, and being placed in a poverty trap due to welfare issues. Roma who do not meet the right to reside or Habitual Residence Condition are not considered job seekers and therefore are not eligible for many training and employment supports (see section 3.3).

The State notes the Special Initiative for Travellers (SIT) employment and recruitment initiative (para. 54), but provides no numbers of participation by Travellers in the Initiative. In fact, the Initiative was cut by -50% during the most recent recession, and 40% of the budget was not spent.<sup>76</sup> Eight of the projects were reportedly still running in 2012 but there is no information on Traveller participation after this. Pavee Point regrets that Travellers and Roma have not been named as target groups in key mainstream policy initiatives- the Pathways to Work Strategy 2016-2020 or the recently published Future Jobs Ireland 2019.<sup>77</sup>

**Recommendation to the Irish State:**

**With due reference to the CERD General Recommendation 32 on Special Measures:**

- a) Develop a comprehensive Traveller and Roma training, employment and enterprise strategy with a robust implementation and monitoring plan, and ensure Travellers and Roma are included in key mainstream policy initiatives related to employment, including the forthcoming Pathways to Work Strategy**

### 3.6 RIGHT TO EDUCATION (para. 49-53)

There are stark inequalities between Travellers and Roma and the general population in participation, attendance, attainment and progression in education. This situation is reinforced by racism, discrimination and identity based bullying in schools.<sup>78</sup>

Travellers – Educational Disadvantage	Roma – Educational Disadvantage <sup>79</sup>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 62% of Travellers experience discrimination at school<sup>80</sup></li> <li>• 13% of female Travellers are educated to upper secondary level or above, compared with 69% of the general population<sup>81</sup></li> <li>• 57% of male Travellers are educated to primary level at most, compared with 13.6% of the general population<sup>82</sup></li> <li>• 28% of Travellers leave school before the age of 13, compared to 1% of non-Travellers<sup>83</sup></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 40% of households with children under the age of five reported that children were attending pre-school</li> <li>• In 78% of households children at primary school age are attending school</li> <li>• In 72% of households children at post primary age are attending school</li> <li>• 57.5% of families do not have enough money for books and uniforms</li> <li>• 6% of households has a member attending third level education</li> </ul>

#### 3.6.1 Travellers and Roma in National Education Policy Initiatives (para 34, 35, 50 & 51)

Pavee Point has welcomed the recommendation by the Advisory Committee of the FCNM in 2019, which urges the State to adopt a coherent Traveller and Roma Education Strategy and an associated implementation plan with clear targets, indicators, timeframes and ring-fenced resources.<sup>84</sup> Pavee Point also welcomes the State’s explicit targeting of Traveller participation in the current Equity of Access to Higher Education Access Plan and the results achieved thus far.

However, considerably more progress is needed. Much of the progress is only possible if Higher Education access is grounded in direct and targeted action at first and second level education, and also incorporates a lifelong learning dimension which explicitly targets and creates opportunities for mature students- Traveller women and men who have been previously denied education opportunities. Currently none of the mainstream educational strategies, including Delivering Equality of Opportunity in Schools Plan 2017 (para. 50), contain actions aimed directly at increasing Traveller participation at early years, primary or post-primary levels.<sup>85</sup>

A 2006 ‘Report and Recommendations for a Traveller Education Strategy’ was never developed into a Strategy but led to the establishment and work of a Traveller Education Advisory Consultative Forum between 2009-2015. The Forum was later devolved into a NTRIS Education Working Group led by the Department of Justice and Equality (para. 34, 35&51).<sup>86</sup> A review by the Department of Education and Skills of the actions in the 2006 Report was meant to be published in 2017 but is still awaited.<sup>87</sup>

Recommendation to the Irish State:
<p>a) <b>With due reference to the CERD General Recommendation 32 on Special Measures, develop a Traveller and Roma education strategy that is inclusive of all ages and educational levels, and ensure that the Strategy has a robust implementation and monitoring plan with associated dedicated resources and a consultative structure to drive its implementation</b></p> <p>a) <b>Complete and publish the review of the 2006 Report and Recommendations for a Traveller Education Strategy with no further delay</b></p>

#### 3.6.2 Mainstreaming Approach to Traveller and Roma Education (para. 52)

Traveller specific education supports were cut by 86.6% following budget 2011 which led to many un-reinstated cuts in supports for Traveller children.<sup>88</sup> The State reports that assistance is provided towards Traveller and Roma specific educational supports (para. 52). However, the capitation grant towards Traveller pupils referred to by the State is the lowest out of all the other qualifying categories; schools must have an approved special class in order to receive the increased capitation

grant; and the funds are assigned to the school, not an individual Traveller pupil.<sup>89</sup> Roma are not a category in the capitation grants.

As a result of the cutbacks to targeted supports, there has been a growing trend in the use of 'reduced timetables' at primary and secondary level schools whereby Traveller children are being placed on reduced hours during school days but are marked as 'present'. Cutting children's school hours is used as a tool to manage behavioural issues related to health, emotional or behavioural issues or conditions, such as ADHD, when schools lack the necessary resources to support children who need additional assistance.<sup>90</sup> In May 2019, the Oireachtas Joint Committee on Education and Skills noted a concern for a lack of data collected by the State on the use of reduced timetables, and called for extra resources to be made available to children at risk or in need of assistance.<sup>91</sup>

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Reintroduce additional and ring-fenced educational supports for Traveller pupils in order to support Traveller access, retention and progression at all levels within the education system and to end the use of 'reduced timetables' as a behavioural management tool with Traveller pupils**

### **3.7 POLITICAL RIGHTS**

Despite calls made by human rights monitoring bodies,<sup>92</sup> Travellers and Roma continue to experience significant exclusion from decision making and wider political processes. While initiatives are currently supported in voter education and registration in the Traveller community, commitments outlined in the National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy (NTRIS) or the National Strategy on Women and Girls (NSWG) have not materialised into measures to improve the representation of Travellers in political institutions and decision making.

The State is allocating Local Authorities increasing powers and role in relation to local governance. This provides opportunities for the inclusion of Travellers and Roma in participative democracy mechanisms. The actions outlined in the recently published Sustainable, Inclusive and Empowered Communities (A Five Year Strategy to Support the Community and Voluntary Sector in Ireland) also provide potentially useful frameworks for supporting Traveller inclusion in local and issue based initiatives, and essential targeted support for Traveller and Roma initiatives. These need to be realised in the upcoming action planning, implementation and monitoring phases of this Strategy.

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Undertake legislative and practical measures to ensure Traveller inclusion in political representation at local and national levels, including reserving specific seats for members of the Traveller community in the houses of the Oireachtas and where relevant, in local councils**
- b) Undertake special measures to promote the inclusion of Traveller and Roma interests in participative democracy, policies, programmes and initiatives undertaken by Local Authorities**

## **SECTION 4: REMEDIES FOR RACIAL DISCRIMINATION – ARTICLE 6**

### **4.1 ACCESS TO COMPLAINT MECHANISMS**

As the main anti-discrimination laws, the Employment Equality Acts (1998-2015) and the Equal Status Acts (2000-2015), prohibit discrimination in employment, accommodation, housing assistance, education, and in the provision of goods and services. The use of complaint mechanisms

by Travellers and Roma is low. In 2018 only six complaints were made under the Employment Equality Acts 1998 to 2011 in relation to membership of the Traveller community.<sup>93</sup>

**Recommendation to the Irish State:**

**a) Resource sustained positive action measures to facilitate access to complaint mechanisms by Travellers and Roma**

**4.2 RIGHT OF ACCESS TO PUBLIC SPACES**

61% of Travellers have experienced discrimination being served in a pub, restaurant or shop<sup>94</sup>, and Travellers are 38 times more likely to report discrimination with regard to access to such places than other “white Irish” persons.<sup>95</sup> 81.1% of Roma experience discrimination in a street or public setting via verbal abuse and racist taunts<sup>96</sup>, and 74% of Roma feel discriminated against when accessing shops, restaurants, pubs and other social venues.<sup>97</sup>

Under the Intoxicating Liquor Act 2003, cases related to access to licensed premises are dealt with through district courts.<sup>98</sup> However, a district court does not have the capacity to undertake inspections and, unlike the Workplace Relations Commission, is not an anti-discrimination body. Data shows that the district court is not an appropriate or effective body to deal with these cases. In 2017, 51 out of 52 applications to the district court under the Act were introduced by Travellers, and 50 out of 52 of the cases were struck off, withdrawn or adjourned.<sup>99</sup> Low levels of literacy and English language skills, lack of documentation and inability to pay legal fees add to the difficulties among Travellers and Roma to access justice through the district courts.<sup>100</sup>

**Recommendation to the Irish State:**

**a) Ensure that Traveller and Roma victims of discrimination in public spaces have the same procedural guarantees as those provided by an anti-discrimination body, such as the Workplace Relations Commission**

**SECTION 5: EFFORTS TO COMBAT RACIAL PREJUDICE – ARTICLE 7**

**5.1 Promoting Traveller and Roma Cultures**

*“Our Traveller community is an integral part of our society for over a millennium, with their own distinct identity – a people within our people (Prime Minister Enda Kenny, March 1st 2017)*

After repeated efforts by Traveller organisations and recommendations by international and national equality and human rights bodies, the State formally recognised Travellers as an indigenous ethnic group in 2017 (para. 12, 28, 29). This symbolic recognition of Travellers was welcomed by Pavee Point and other Traveller organisations. Since then, there has been some developments starting in the area of education (see section 5.2), but the recognition of Traveller ethnicity hasn't yet led to the inclusion of Travellers in anti-racism and intercultural initiatives and legislation (see section 1.2, 2.1 and 1.2.2).

Pavee Point has welcomed financial support by the State towards small projects as part of the annual Traveller Pride Week, which aims to celebrate Traveller culture. However, the Advisory Committee on the FCNM has noted that the funding provided towards Traveller pride week is ad hoc in nature and project-based.<sup>101</sup> The Committee has called for the State to take immediate action to support Travellers in preserving and developing their identity and culture on a more permanent and ongoing basis, as well as to undertake awareness raising activities with the general population to inform them about the level of anti-Traveller discrimination.



#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Develop and implement an awareness raising campaign with the general population about anti-Traveller and Roma racism and provide support towards the preservation of Traveller and Roma cultures on a permanent and ongoing basis**

### **5.2 Traveller and Roma Cultures in Schools**

Positive developments are taking place in relation to including Traveller culture and history in the school curriculum, and cross-party support for a Traveller Culture Education Bill which holds potential to create a more inclusive school environment for Travellers.<sup>102</sup> However, to ensure effective implementation upon their enactment, steps must be taken to ensure that policy and practice in schools are in line with interculturalism, anti-discrimination and anti-racism, and that they explicitly focus on Travellers and Roma.

#### **Recommendation to the Irish State:**

- a) Ensure that the inclusion of Traveller culture and history in school curriculum takes place in active consultation with Traveller organisations and acts as a precedent for further inclusion of all the cultures which are part of Ireland**
- b) Undertake measures to ensure ongoing mandatory training of education personnel on anti-Traveller and Roma discrimination and racism, and ensure school inspections and other monitoring and accountability systems include assessment of schools' interculturalism and anti-racism policies, curricula, and practice**

### **5.3 Awareness Raising with Law Enforcement Officials**

The State reports (para. 91-92) that training activities on human rights, anti-racism and anti-profiling are delivered to specific *units* or *ranks* within the police, and that training on anti-profiling and anti-discriminatory policing techniques is only delivered to Ethnic Liaison Officers and other groups within the service “*at the request of the Garda College*” (para. 92). Considering the issues with policing Travellers and Roma (see section 3.1 and Appendix 1), it is apparent that the training is not adequate, effective or ongoing, and isn't consistently delivered across all ranks and units of the police - including initial police training for new recruits. Furthermore, such training is not incorporated into performance assessments and promotion and assignment processes of the police.

Training on equality and human rights issues with Judiciary is reportedly delivered on an ongoing basis. However, evidence shows that there are significant concerns with administering justice with Traveller and Roma communities (see section 3.1), as well as examples of anti-Traveller and Roma sentiments expressed by members of the Judiciary (See Appendix 2).

#### **Recommendation to the State:**

- a) Incorporate human rights, anti-racism and anti-profiling training within initial and ongoing training with the police and Judiciary with a specific focus on the human rights of Travellers and Roma, and include these aspects in performance assessments, promotion and assignment processes of the police**

### **5.4 Recruitment of Travellers and Roma within Public Services**

Increased inclusion of Travellers and Roma within the workforce in the public sector would provide a sustainable means to promote tolerance and diversity within public services, and support to improve relations between members of public services and Traveller and Roma communities. Currently there are no dedicated quotas set for Travellers and Roma in the recruitment policy and practice in the police, state departments, Local Authorities and other public bodies.<sup>103</sup> In October 2019, the Garda

(police) Commissioner indicated a desire to see an increase in diversity within the organisation in its upcoming recruitment, including an increase in members of the Traveller community.<sup>104</sup>

**Recommendation to the State:**

- a) Adopt special measures to train and employ Travellers and Roma in public bodies by including dedicated quotas for Travellers and Roma in recruitment policies within the police, state departments, Local Authorities and other public bodies**

## Appendix 1. Examples of Ethnic Profiling of Travellers and Roma by the Police

**Evidence highlights serious concerns around ethnic profiling with Traveller and Roma communities:**

- 77.5% of Roma report being stopped by the police for an identity document, and of those, 56% report being stopped four times or more.<sup>105</sup>
- In 2013, in two separate instances two Roma children were removed from their biological parents by the police under Section 12 of the Child Care Act 1991 under a suspicion the children had been abducted.<sup>106</sup> Subsequent inquiry found that the removal of one of the children amounted to ethnic profiling.<sup>107</sup> A further audit of the use of the Section 12 of the Child Care Act found that crucial demographic data to draw conclusions about ethnic profiling is not recorded in the PULSE (police data base).<sup>108</sup>
- In 2014, a Traveller mother discovered that her children aged 4 and 5 were recorded and given criminal tag numbers in the PULSE. The children's details were logged in 2011 after their parents visited a police station in relation to passport applications. The mother was not aware of this until informed by a freelance journalist in 2014. In 2014, a police whistle-blower alleged that up to 40 Traveller families were entered on the PULSE system, including a 16 days old baby, and that these registrations on PULSE were made without any proper foundation, criminal or otherwise.<sup>109</sup>

## Appendix 2: Examples of Hate Speech and Crime against Travellers and Roma

**Anti-Roma and Traveller Statements by Public Officials:**

- In 2018 Presidential Election, candidate Peter Casey made a number of offensive remarks about Travellers during his campaign.<sup>110</sup> He came second in the election, with 23.25% of all votes.<sup>111</sup>
- Fianna Fáil (political party) councillor: *"there should be an isolated community of them [Travellers] some place..."*. The statement was backed by a Fine Gael (political party) Town Councillor who noted that *"They [Travellers] can be sent to Spike Island for all I care"*.<sup>112</sup>
- District Court judge and former Fianna Fail member of parliament: *"[Travellers are] Neanderthal men ... abiding by the laws of the jungle"*<sup>113</sup>
- Dublin Circuit Criminal Court Justice: *"I assume from his appearance that he's from the Roma community who came here to do what all of them tend to do, to use the streets to beg"*<sup>114</sup>

**Anti-Roma Protests in Waterford, 2014:** Over 100 people gathered chanting "Roma, out, out, out" and smashing windows and kicking doors in. Families had to be evacuated from their homes due to the violence.<sup>115</sup>

**Burning and Vandalising Travellers' Homes:**

- Donegal, 2013: A house allocated to a Traveller family was burnt in an arson attack to prevent the family from moving in. The events were followed by anti-Traveller statements made by local councillors.<sup>116</sup>
- Tipperary, 2019: A Traveller family was allocated a house and was ready to move in when the house was vandalised with significant damage made to the house.<sup>117</sup>

**Online Hate Speech:**

"Promote the use of Kn\*\*\*er babies for Shark Bait" – Court Case: A Facebook page suggesting to use Traveller babies as shark bait and fed to zoo animals was found 'obnoxious, revolting and insulting' by the Judge but was not deemed to be incitement to hatred.<sup>118</sup>

## ENDNOTES

---

<sup>1</sup> Under Section 42 of the Irish Human Rights and Equality Act 2014, all public bodies in Ireland have a legal responsibility to promote equality, prevent discrimination and protect the human rights of their employees, customers, service users and everyone affected by their policies and plans.

<sup>2</sup> Pavee Point has also made a submission to the Collective Civil Society Alternative Report by ENAR (European Network against Racism) Ireland.

<sup>3</sup> Pavee Point's civil society monitoring on the implementation of National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy consultations in 2017 and 2018, and CEDAW consultation with Traveller & Roma women, 2016. Key pieces of research commissioned by the State: Curran, S., A. Crickley, R. Fay, F. Mc Gaughey (eds), *Roma in Ireland - a National Needs Assessment*, Department of Justice and Equality and Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre, 2018; Kelleher et al., *All Ireland Traveller Health Study*, University College Dublin & Department of Health and Children, 2010.

<sup>4</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.

<sup>5</sup> McGinnity, F., R. Grotti, O. Kenny and H. Russell, *Who experiences discrimination in Ireland?: Evidence from the QNHS Equality Modules*, Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission and Economic and Social Research Institute, 2017, <https://www.ihrec.ie/app/uploads/2017/11/Who-experiences-discrimination-in-Ireland-Report.pdf>.

<sup>6</sup> Ibid.

<sup>7</sup> Kelleher et al. *All Ireland Traveller Health Study*, 2010.

<sup>8</sup> UNCEDAW, 2017; UNCRC, 2016; UNCESCR, 2015; HRC, 2014; FCNM, 2019; ECRI, 2019; ECRI, *Second Report on Ireland*, CRI (2002) 3, 23 April 2002.

<sup>9</sup> The Central Statistics Office has included Travellers as an administrative category in the Census since 2006, and Roma will be included for the first time in Census 2021. Progress has also been seen with ethnic data collection in the monitoring system for the national Social Inclusion and Community Activation Programme, and the National Drug Treatment Recording System.

<sup>10</sup> E.g. Prison and Probation services and small number of health services have introduced ethnic identifiers. However, ethnic categories are not standardised; ethnic identity is often ascribed to Travellers and Roma by using proxies such as name or looks; and the data is not disaggregated, analysed or provided to stakeholders within an appropriate timeframe.

<sup>11</sup> Also reported by the Courts and Police services through monitoring committee meetings of the *National Strategy on Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based Violence*. All State agencies initially committed to developing a 'gold standard of data collection, including by ethnicity, through this Strategy.

<sup>12</sup> *Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission Act 2014*, Section 42.

<sup>13</sup> Pavee Point is aware of the State having introduced an ethnic identifier at primary and post-primary level education, but at post-primary level only Traveller students are required to identify their ethnicity.

<sup>14</sup> Joyce, S., M. Kennedy and A. Haynes, 'Travellers and Roma in Ireland: Understanding Hate Crime Data through the Lens of Structural Inequality,' in Haynes et al., *Critical Perspectives on Hate Crime*, 325-354.

<sup>15</sup> According to the CSO, the police fail to record motives correctly when discrimination is present and record a motive when no discrimination is present. This was the case in 27% of the cases from 2017, in Central Statistics Office, *Census 2016 Crime and Justice*; Central Statistics Office, *Review of the Quality of Recorded Crime Statistics: Based on 2017 Data Provided by An Garda Síochána*, 2018,

[https://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/releasespublications/documents/crimejustice/2017/Review\\_of\\_Quality\\_Crime\\_2017.pdf](https://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/releasespublications/documents/crimejustice/2017/Review_of_Quality_Crime_2017.pdf).

<sup>16</sup> HRC, *Concluding Observations on the Fourth Periodic Report of Ireland*, CCPR/C/IRL/4, 2014; FCNM, *Fourth Opinion on Ireland*, ACFC/OP/IV(2018)005, 20 June 2019; ECRI, *Fifth Report on Ireland*, CRI(2019)18, 4 June 2019; UNCRC, 2016.

<sup>17</sup> ECRI, 2019.

<sup>18</sup> Department of Justice and Equality, 'Minister Stanton announces new Anti-Racism Committee', 28 June 2019,

<http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PR19000174>.

<sup>19</sup> Since September 2019, the Office for the Promotion of Migrant Integration (OPMI) no longer exists as part of the restructuring of the Department of Justice and Equality.

<sup>20</sup> Actions on anti-Roma and Traveller racism are included in the *National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy* but no action has been taken to date.

<sup>21</sup> Pavee Point has welcomed the adoption of Ireland's second NTRIS which contains 149 actions across 10 thematic areas. Unlike Ireland's first NTRIS (2011), it was developed in consultation with Travellers and Roma.

<sup>22</sup> FCMN, 2019.

<sup>23</sup> UNCRC, 2016; UNCEDAW, 2017; ECRI, 2019; FCNM, 2019.

<sup>24</sup> Pobal, *Social Inclusion and Community Activation Programme (SICAP) 2016 End of Year Report*, 52.

<sup>25</sup> Figures provided by Department of Housing, Planning, Community & Local Government regarding SICAP priorities in 2016.

<sup>26</sup> To date, no consultation has taken place with Traveller or Roma organisations on the development of the new Strategy.

<sup>27</sup> UNCEDAW, *Concluding Observations on the Combined Sixth and Seventh Periodic Reports of Ireland*, CEDAW/C/IRL/CO/6-7, 9 March 2017; UNCRC, *Concluding Observations on the Combined Third and Fourth Periodic Reports of Ireland*, CRC/C/IRL/CO/3-4 4, 1 March 2016; UNCESCR, *Concluding Observations on the Third Periodic Report of Ireland*, E/C.12/IRL/CO/3, 19 June 2015; Daly, M., *Investing in Children: Breaking the Cycle of Disadvantage - A Study of National Policies, Country Report - Ireland*, European Commission, 2014. The Commissioner, Nils Muižnieks, conducted a three-day visit to Ireland in 2016, <http://www.coe.int/en/web/commissioner/-/ireland-advance-equality-of-travellers-and-women>. During 2008-2013, Traveller education supports were cut by -86.6%; Traveller accommodation budget cut by -90% with 36% of the allocated budget remaining unspent; FAS SIT (Traveller employment initiative) was cut by -50% with 40% of the budget remaining unspent; 18% of Traveller health budgets were left unspent, in Harvey, B., *Travelling with Austerity: Impacts of Cuts on Travellers, Traveller Projects & Services*, Pavee Point, 2013.

- 
- <sup>28</sup> ECRI, *Fourth Report on Ireland*, CRI(2013)1, 19 February 2013; ECRI, *Fifth Report on Ireland*, CRI(2019)18, 4 June 2019.
- <sup>29</sup> Since 2000 there have been only 5 convictions under the 1989 Act and of those, only 2 resulted in imprisonment in Gallagher, C., 'Courts Service reveals five convictions for hate crime since 1989', *Irish Times*, 19 June 2017, <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/crime-and-law/courts-service-reveals-five-convictions-for-hate-crime-since-1989-1.3124352>.
- <sup>30</sup> The review has been ongoing for a number of years, with no available timeframe for publication. Statement by Minister Flanagan on hate crime legislation, available at: <http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/SP18000222>.
- <sup>31</sup> The Criminal Justice (Aggravation by Prejudice) Bill 2016 has been introduced, however the Bill as it currently stands has a very narrow scope. It only considers racist motivation at the sentencing stage and does not provide for a specific offence of hate crime.
- <sup>32</sup> FCNM, 2019; ECRI, 2019.
- <sup>33</sup> FCNM, 2019.
- <sup>34</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>35</sup> Travellers in Prison Initiative 'Hearing Their Voices,' 2017. In September 2019, video footage emerged on social media where a member of the police and fire brigade services engaged in impersonating and mocking the Traveller community. Subsequent to the events, the Garda Commissioner and the individuals appearing in the footage visited Pavee Point to issue an apology. The police in the footage has been suspended upon investigation and disciplinary procedures have been initiated.
- <sup>36</sup> 'Garda Commissioner Includes Traveller Community in 'Increased Diversity' Message', *Independent*, 26 Sep 2019, <https://www.independent.ie/breaking-news/irish-news/garda-commissioner-includes-traveller-community-in-increased-diversity-message-38538200.html>.
- <sup>37</sup> FCNM, 2019; *Garda Síochána (Discipline) Regulation 2007*, <http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2007/si/214/made/en/print>; Irish Council for Civil Liberties, *Rights-based policing, how do we get there?: A submission by the ICCL to the Commission on the future of policing*, 2018, pg. 28, <https://www.iccl.ie/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/RIGHTS-BASED-POLICING-ICCL-submission-to-CFP-2.pdf>.
- <sup>38</sup> FCNM, 2019.
- <sup>39</sup> Policing Authority, *Code of Ethics for the Garda Síochána*, 2017. The Code requires Gardai to 'recognise and respect the dignity and equal human rights of all people, to treat everyone at all times with fairness and in a non-discriminatory fashion, and to oppose and challenge any behaviour or language that demonstrates discrimination or disrespect, in particular with regard to vulnerable individuals and minority groups'.
- <sup>40</sup> Irish Council for Civil Liberties, *A Human Rights-Based Approach to Policing in Ireland*, 2018.
- <sup>41</sup> House of the Oireachtas, *Garda Code of Ethics Dáil Éireann Debate*, 29 May 2018, <https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/question/2018-05-29/297/>
- <sup>42</sup> FCNM, 2019, para. 61.
- <sup>43</sup> Irish Prison Service, *Census of Travellers in Prison*, 2018; Travellers in Prison Initiative 'Hearing Their Voices,' 2017.
- <sup>44</sup> Kelleher et al., *All Ireland Traveller Health Study*, 2010.
- <sup>45</sup> Travellers in Prison Initiative, 'Hearing their Voices', 2017.
- <sup>46</sup> Irish Penal Reform Trust, *Travellers in the Irish Prison System: A Qualitative Study*, 2014.
- <sup>47</sup> The Irish Prison Service Strategic Plan 2016-2018 and Joint Irish Prison Service and Probation Service Strategic Plan 2018-2020 contain welcomed actions to respond to the needs of Travellers who are in prison. However, no measures have been introduced to address the over-representation of Travellers in prison and the contributing factors that increase their risk of imprisonment.
- <sup>48</sup> CEDAW, 2017, para. 52.
- <sup>49</sup> RSM, *Research Report, Review of Funding for Traveller-Specific Accommodation and the Implementation of Traveller Accommodation Programmes*, The Housing Agency, 2017. The Housing Agency is a government body working with the Department of Housing, Planning & Local Government, Local Authorities and Approved Housing Bodies (AHBs) in the delivery of housing.
- <sup>50</sup> UNCRC, 2016; HRC, 2014; , CESCR 2015; CEDAW, 2017, the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights, FCNM, 2019; ECRI, 2019; Council of Europe's Commissioner for Human Rights, Nils Muižnieks, 2016.
- <sup>51</sup> Independent Expert Group on behalf of the Minister of the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government, *Traveller Accommodation Expert Review*, 2019, [https://www.housing.gov.ie/sites/default/files/publications/files/2019\\_july\\_expert\\_review\\_group\\_traveller\\_accommodation-final\\_reporttr\\_00.pdf](https://www.housing.gov.ie/sites/default/files/publications/files/2019_july_expert_review_group_traveller_accommodation-final_reporttr_00.pdf).
- <sup>52</sup> FCNM, 2019; ECRI, 2019. The ECRI proposes imposing sanctions on local authorities for failure to spend allocated funding, or removing the responsibility for Traveller accommodation from local authorities and placing it under the authority of a central housing commission as potential solutions to the issue.
- <sup>53</sup> The Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government's Annual Count reflects that 15% of Travellers are in need of accommodation; with 1,115 Traveller families 'sharing' accommodation. This number has been rapidly increasing each year, with the most recent count indicating an almost 30% increase of Travellers sharing accommodation since 2014. Sharing is in effect being homeless and it meets the criteria for homelessness as defined by the European Descriptive Typology (ETHOS).
- <sup>54</sup> Irish Human Rights & Equality Commission, 'Human Rights & Equality Commission Launches National Review into Council Traveller Accommodation Provision', 28 June 2019, <https://www.ihrec.ie/human-rights-and-equality-commission-launches-national-review-into-council-traveller-accommodation-provision/>; Independent Expert Group, *Traveller Accommodation Expert Review*, 2019.
- <sup>55</sup> In 2016, the European Committee of Social Rights found Ireland to be in violation of Article 16 of the European Social Charter on five grounds, including insufficient provision of accommodation for Travellers. The Committee also noted unreasonable grounds for Traveller evictions and insufficient legislation which allows for evictions to take place with no less than 24 hours' notice.
- <sup>56</sup> UNCRC, 2016; HRC, 2014; , CESCR 2015; , CEDAW, 2017, the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights, FCNM, 2019; ECRI, 2019; Independent Expert Group, *Traveller Accommodation Expert Review*, 2019.
- <sup>57</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>58</sup> The figures are likely to be higher as people living with family and friends in overcrowded conditions are not recorded.

- <sup>59</sup> Many Roma are unable to access homeless services due to inability to prove their residency in an area. Curran, et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>60</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>61</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>62</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018; *Directive 2004/38/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council*, 2004, <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2004:158:0077:0123:en:PDF>.
- <sup>63</sup> The habitual residence test is intended to evaluate if a person has a connection with the Irish State, Department of Social Protection *Habitual Residence Condition*, <http://www.welfare.ie/en/downloads/sw108.pdf>.
- <sup>64</sup> 25.5% of Roma don't have the right to reside and 38.5% of Roma don't know if they have a right to reside. 25.7% of Roma are not habitually resident and 26.9% don't know if they are habitually resident. Lack of identification and Personal Public Service numbers among Roma parents also makes it impossible to register the birth of a child. Curran et al., 2018.
- <sup>65</sup> UNGA, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on extreme poverty and human rights*, Magdalena Sepúlveda Carmona, A/HRC/20/25, 2012, Para 102; ECRI, 2013, CEDAW, 2017; CRC, 2016; HRC, 2014; CESCR, 2015.
- <sup>66</sup> CRC, 2016, para. 70(f).
- <sup>67</sup> Pavee Point spearheaded the first national participatory study of Traveller health in Ireland which was published in 2010. The All Ireland Health Study was the first national study that significantly involved Travellers in the implementation of the research and the participation of Travellers as peer researchers resulted in a response rate of 80%. Kelleher et al., *All Ireland Traveller Health Study*, 2010.
- <sup>68</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>69</sup> Recommendations from the *Traveller Health Strategy* and the *National Intercultural Health Strategy* were poorly implemented.
- <sup>70</sup> Sláintecare is a ten-year programme by the State to transform health and social care services in Ireland.
- <sup>71</sup> Healthy Ireland is a government-led initiative aimed at improving the health and wellbeing of people living in the State.
- <sup>72</sup> The draft plan by the HSE in 2019 ignored recommendations from a consultation process and lacked budget lines, indicators, verification measures and an institutional mechanism to drive implementation. The HSE has committed to redrafting the plan.
- <sup>73</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>74</sup> Kelleher et al., *All Ireland Traveller Health Study*, 2010.
- <sup>75</sup> Central Statistics Office, *Census 2016 Profile 8 - Irish Travellers, Ethnicity and Religion*, 2016.
- <sup>76</sup> Harvey, B., *Travelling with Austerity*, 2013.
- <sup>77</sup> Government of Ireland, *Future Jobs Ireland- 2019- Preparing Now for Tomorrow's Economy*, Department of the Taoiseach and the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation, 2019.
- <sup>78</sup> The Department of Education and Skills introduced an ethnic identifier at primary level in 2014 and at post primary level in 2016. The data has not been made public. Perry, C., E. Keane, M. Callaghan, M. Molcho, *Short Report, HBSC Ireland 2014: Traveller children's health and lifestyle compared to all other children in Ireland*, HBSC Ireland, Health Promotion Research Centre: National University of Ireland, 2014, <http://www.nuigalway.ie/media/healthpromotionresearchcentre/hbscdocs/shortreports/2016-SR-CP-Traveller-childrens-health.pdf>.
- <sup>79</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.
- <sup>80</sup> Kelleher et al., *All Ireland Traveller Health Study*, 2010.
- <sup>81</sup> Central Statistics Office, 2016.
- <sup>82</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>83</sup> Watson, D., Kenny, O and McGinnity, 2017, *A Social Portrait of Travellers in Ireland*, Dublin, ESRI.
- <sup>84</sup> FCNM, 2019.
- <sup>85</sup> Delivering Equality of Opportunity in Schools Plan 2017 merely makes references to a target for increasing Traveller participation in higher education from 35 to 80 Travellers which was already actioned in *National Plan for Equity of Access to Higher Education 2015-2019*. Action Plan for Education 2016-2019 contains actions on audit of Traveller culture in curriculum; collaboration with Traveller representative groups, and developing an action to increase Traveller participation in higher education, <https://www.education.ie/en/Publications/Corporate-Reports/Strategy-Statement/action-plan-for-education-2019.pdf>.
- <sup>86</sup> Action 17 of the NTRIS aims to implement community based supports to assist retention of Traveller and Roma children in education. As part of this action, 4 Traveller education pilot projects are being initiated through a NTRIS education sub-group.
- <sup>87</sup> Action 11 of the NTRIS; Houses of the Oireachtas, *Traveller Education Dáil Éireann Debate*, 23 October 2018, <https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/question/2018-10-23/294/>.
- <sup>88</sup> Harvey, B., *Travelling with Austerity*, 2013. Visiting Teachers for Travellers scheme and the posts of Resource Teachers for Travellers were abolished. Home School Community Liaison teachers (HSCL) are now responsible for liaising between schools and families but this model cannot cater for Traveller community due to its remit and lack of resourcing. HSCL teachers are not available in many rural DEIS (Delivering Equality of Opportunity in Schools) schools and are not available at all in non-DEIS schools. Subsequent to the phasing out of segregated schools and classrooms for Traveller children since 2006, the State has insisted on a mainstreaming approach, in Houses of the Oireachtas, *Traveller Education Dáil Éireann Debate*, 23 October 2018, <https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/question/2018-10-23/294/>.
- <sup>89</sup> Department of Education & Skills, *Capitation and Ancillary Services Grants*, Circular Letter 0028/2016, [https://www.education.ie/en/Circulars-and-Forms/Archived-Circulars/cl0028\\_2016.pdf](https://www.education.ie/en/Circulars-and-Forms/Archived-Circulars/cl0028_2016.pdf). No public documentation on capitation grants is provided after 2016 that would allow for comparison between the amount towards Traveller and other pupils.
- <sup>90</sup> Amin, N., R. Fay, L Kavanagh, K. Lawrence (eds), *Traveller Health Needs Assessment: County Clare*, Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre and Mid West Traveller Health Unit (THU), 2019.
- <sup>91</sup> Joint Oireachtas Committee on Education and Skills, *Report on the Committee's examination on the Progression of Travellers from primary-, to Secondary- and Third-Level Education*, 2019, [https://data.oireachtas.ie/ie/oireachtas/committee/dail/32/joint\\_committee\\_on\\_education\\_and\\_skills/reports/2019/2019-05-](https://data.oireachtas.ie/ie/oireachtas/committee/dail/32/joint_committee_on_education_and_skills/reports/2019/2019-05-)

[31\\_report-on-committee-s-examination-on-the-progression-of-travellers-from-primary-to-secondary-and-third-level-education\\_en.pdf](#). In September 2019, the Minister for Education announced draft rules for schools to formally notify Tusla, the Child and Family Agency, when a child's school hours are cut, O'Brien, C., 'Schools to Notify Social Services When Pupils on Reduced Hours', *Irish Times*, 23 Sep 2019, <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/education/schools-to-notify-social-services-when-pupils-on-reduced-hours-1.4026650>.

<sup>92</sup> FCNM, *Opinion on Ireland*, ACFC/INF/OP/I(2004)003, 5 May 2004; FCNM, *Second Opinion on Ireland*, ACFC/OP/II(2006)007, 30 October 2006; FCNM, *Third Opinion on Ireland*, ACFC/OP/III(2012)006, 19 April 2013; CERD, *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination: Ireland*, CERD/C/IRL/CO/2, 2005; FCNM, 2019; CEDAW, 2017; CERD, 2011; Council of Europe, *Report by the Commissioner for Human Rights Mr. Thomas Hammarberg on His Visit to Ireland*, Strasbourg, 2008. Available at:

[https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?p=&id=1283555&Site=CommDH&BackColorInternet=FEC65B&BackColorIntranet=FEC65B&BackColorLogged=FFC679&direct=true#P402\\_100717&direct=true](https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?p=&id=1283555&Site=CommDH&BackColorInternet=FEC65B&BackColorIntranet=FEC65B&BackColorLogged=FFC679&direct=true#P402_100717&direct=true).

<sup>93</sup> Workplace Relations Commission, *Annual Report 2018*.

<sup>94</sup> Kelleher et al., *All-Ireland Traveller Health Study*, 2010.

<sup>95</sup> McGinnity, F., R. Grotti, O. Kenny and H. Russell, *Who experiences discrimination in Ireland?: Evidence from the QNHS Equality Modules*, Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission and Economic and Social Research Institute, 2017.

<sup>96</sup> Curran et al., *National Needs Assessment*, 2018.

<sup>97</sup> Ibid.

<sup>98</sup> Section 19 of the *Intoxicating Liquor Act 2003*, <http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2003/act/31/enacted/en/html>.

<sup>99</sup> According to official data communicated by the Courts Service to the Advisory Committee of the FCNM, in FCNM, 2019.

<sup>100</sup> OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities, *Graz Recommendations on Access to Justice and National Minorities & Explanatory Note*, 2017, recommended the State to take "measures to guarantee access to justice for national minorities should be broader than providing access to courts. States should establish, strengthen and fund independent human rights institutions that can secure effective remedies for all complainants, including persons belonging to national minorities. Available at:

<https://www.osce.org/hcnm/graz-recommendations?download=true>.

<sup>101</sup> FCNM, 2019.

<sup>102</sup> The Traveller Culture and History in Education Bill 2018 is currently before Seanad Éireann, Fourth Stage, <https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/bills/bill/2018/71/>.

<sup>103</sup> NTRIS, Action 28 calls for proposals to be developed for internships for Travellers and Roma in Government Departments, Local Authorities and other Public Bodies. To date, no progress has been made on this action.

<sup>104</sup> Garda Commissioner Includes Traveller Community in 'Increased Diversity' Message', *Independent*, 26 Sep 2019.

<sup>105</sup> Curran et al., *Roma Needs Assessment*, 2018.

<sup>106</sup> 2 year old Child A in Athlone and 7 year old Child T in Dublin both had blonde hair and looked different from their parents. They were subsequently returned back to the parents. Section 12 of the Act authorises police to remove a child from the care of his/her family in circumstances where a police officer believes there is an immediate and serious risk to the health or welfare of a child and where it would not be sufficient to await the making of an application for an emergency care order.

<sup>107</sup> Ombudsman for Children, *Garda Síochána Act 2005 (Section 42) (Special Inquiries relating to Garda Síochána) Order 2013*, 2014. Available at: <http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Emily%20Logan%20report.pdf/Files/Emily%20Logan%20report.pdf>.

<sup>108</sup> Shannon, G., *Audit of the Exercise by An Garda Síochána of the Provisions of Section 12 of the Child Care Act 1991*, Department of Justice and Equality, 2017,

<https://www.drugsandalcohol.ie/27362/1/Audit%20of%20Section%2012%20Child%20Care%20Act%201991.pdf>.

<sup>109</sup> Barry, A., 'Garda Síochána "does not engage in ethnic profiling"', *The Journal.ie*, 26 March 2014,

<https://www.thejournal.ie/garda-racial-profiling-pulse-allegations-1383045-Mar2014/>.

<sup>110</sup> "Travellers should not be recognised as an ethnic minority because they are basically people camping in someone else's land, and that Travellers are not paying their fair share of taxes in society", in Loughlin, E., D. McConnell, 'Peter Casey refuses to back down over Traveller comments', *Irish Examiner*, 18 October 2018, <https://www.irishexaminer.com/breakingnews/ireland/peter-casey-refuses-to-back-down-over-traveller-comments-876533.html>.

<sup>111</sup> 'Presidential Election Results', *The Irish Times*, <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/politics/presidential-election/results>.

<sup>112</sup> Bohan, C., 'FF councillor criticised for anti-Traveller comments', *The Journal.ie*, 17 January 2013,

<https://www.thejournal.ie/fianna-fail-councillor-sean-mceniiff-traveller-comments-758655-Jan2013/>; 'Councillor opinion on Travellers', *The Irish Times*, 24 January 2013, <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/councillor-opinion-on-travellers-1.965292>.

<sup>113</sup> 'Calls for judge to resign over 'Neanderthal' comment on Travellers', *The Journal*, 12 September 2012,

<https://www.thejournal.ie/judge-travellers-comments-law-of-the-jungle-592523-Sep2012/>.

<sup>114</sup> McMahon, C., 'He should never have been in our country', *Irish Mirror*, 21 March 2013,

<https://www.irishmirror.ie/incoming/roma-gypsy-who-attacked-two-1777252>.

<sup>115</sup> Holland, K., 'Waterford Anti-Roma Protests Criticised as 'Cowardly and Racist'', *The Irish Times*, 27 October 2014,

<https://www.irishtimes.com/news/social-affairs/waterford-anti-roma-protests-criticised-as-cowardly-and-racist-1.1978572>.

<sup>116</sup> Council's €230k social housing property destroyed in fire', *The Journal*, 12 February 2013, <https://www.thejournal.ie/fire-house-ballyshannon-county-council-792065-Feb2013/>. In 2013, Roma were subjected to a number of attacks on their houses, including windows being broken and threats being made, 'Tallaght Roma girls' family victims of racist attacks', *The Journal*, 23 October 2013, <https://www.thejournal.ie/roma-tallaght-racist-1144134-Oct2013/>.

<sup>117</sup> Kane, C., 'Vandals attack home set to house Traveller family', *The Irish Examiner*, 8 March 2019,

<https://www.irishexaminer.com/breakingnews/ireland/vandals-attack-home-set-to-house-traveller-family-909535.html>.

<sup>118</sup> O'Mahony, J., 'Man cleared of online hatred against Travellers', *The Irish Examiner*, 1 October 2011,

<https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/man-cleared-of-online-hatred-against-travellers-169325.html>.